GUILDFORD BOROUGH COUNCIL

Minutes of a meeting of Guildford Borough Council held at Council Chamber, Millmead House, Millmead, Guildford, Surrey GU2 4BB on Tuesday 10 October, 2017

* Councillor Nigel Manning (Mayor)
* Councillor Mike Parsons (Deputy Mayor)

- * Councillor David Bilbé
- * Councillor Richard Billington
- * Councillor Philip Brooker
- * Councillor Adrian Chandler
- * Councillor Alexandra Chesterfield
- * Councillor Nils Christiansen
- * Councillor Colin Cross
- * Councillor Geoff Davis
- * Councillor Graham Ellwood
- * Councillor David Elms
- * Councillor Matt Furniss
- * Councillor Andrew Gomm
- * Councillor Angela Goodwin
- * Councillor David Goodwin
- * Councillor Murray Grubb Jnr
- * Councillor Angela Gunning
- * Councillor Gillian Harwood
- * Councillor Liz Hogger
- * Councillor Christian Holliday
- * Councillor Liz Hooper
- * Councillor Mike Hurdle
- * Councillor Michael Illman
- * Councillor Gordon Jackson

- * Councillor Jennifer Jordan
- * Councillor Nigel Kearse
- * Councillor Sheila Kirkland
- * Councillor Julia McShane
- * Councillor Bob McShee
- Councillor Marsha Moseley
- * Councillor Nikki Nelson-Smith
- * Councillor Susan Parker
- * Councillor Dennis Paul
- * Councillor Tony Phillips
- * Councillor Mike Piper
- * Councillor David Quelch Councillor Jo Randall
- * Councillor David Reeve
- * Councillor Caroline Reeves
- * Councillor Iseult Roche
- * Councillor Tony Rooth
- * Councillor Matthew Sarti
- * Councillor Pauline Searle
- * Councillor Paul Spooner
- * Councillor James Walsh
- Councillor Jenny Wicks
- * Councillor David Wright

*Present

Honorary Aldermen B Parke and T Patrick were also in attendance.

The Council stood in silent tribute to the memory of Honorary Freeman Bill Bellerby MBE, who had passed away on 19 September 2017.

CO45 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Jo Randall, from Honorary Freeman Jen Powell and from Honorary Aldermen K Childs, Mrs C F Cobley, Mrs C F P Griffin, Mrs M Lloyd-Jones, J Marks, and L Strudwick.

CO46 DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

There were no disclosures of interest.

CO47 MINUTES

The Council confirmed, as a correct record, the minutes of the Council Meeting held on 25 July 2017. The Mayor signed the minutes.

CO48 MAYOR'S COMMUNICATIONS

His Honour Christopher Critchlow

The Mayor had great pleasure in conveying the Council's thanks and good wishes to His Honour Christopher Critchlow, who had served with distinction as Honorary Recorder of Guildford, from October 2010 to July 2017, and presenting to him a small gift.

Kazuo Ishiguro

On behalf of the Council, the Mayor congratulated well-known novelist, and former resident of Guildford, Kazuo Ishiguro, who had recently been awarded the Nobel Prize for Literature for 2017.

Forthcoming charitable events

The Mayor drew attention to a number of forthcoming charitable events to raise money for the British Heart Foundation and the Mayor's Distress Fund.

CO49 LEADER'S COMMUNICATIONS

The Leader paid tribute to the huge contribution that the late Honorary Freeman Bill Bellerby MBE had made to the Borough and its residents over so many years, and indicated that the Council would be investigating options for the erection of a permanent memorial to both Bill and Doreen Bellerby.

CO50 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Mr George Dokimakis addressed the Council meeting in tribute to Bill and Doreen Bellerby.

The Leader of the Council responded to the statement.

CO51 QUESTIONS FROM COUNCILLORS

Councillor Susan Parker asked the Deputy Leader of the Council, Councillor Matt Furniss, the following question:

"May I ask the Deputy Leader to please explain the financial implications of the proposals in the Twinning and International Relationships report (see Item 8 on the Council agenda), including:

- (1) Will there be any promotion of investment in property within the Guildford area as part of this delegation's activities?
- (2) What is the policy on publicising inward property investment? Given paragraph 7.2 (e) of the report, noting that one of the potential benefits is deemed to be "To promote Guildford and the UK as a destination for investment" will the Council's representatives confirm that they will not be encouraging inward property investment from Chinese investors to the Guildford area?
- (3) How will accommodation and entertainment be paid for? Is this included in the budget of £5,000 as mentioned in paragraph 12.3 of the report?
- (4) Will councillors receive any airmiles personally as a result of this trip?
- (5) Given anecdotal comment on a culture of gift exchange within China, please explain the cost of any proposed gifts to be provided by the Guildford delegation, together with the policy on any gifts received by our delegation."

The Deputy Leader's response was as follows:

- (1) In response to part (1) of the question: The Council delegation will not be initiating any discussion on residential property investment.
- (2) In response to part (2) of the question: We do not have a policy on publicising inward property investment.
- (3) In response to part (3) of the question: The cost of accommodation and meals is included within the revised figures set out in the Supplementary information referred to on page 4 of the Order Paper, or will be met by Dongying Municipal Government when the delegation visits the city on 15 and 16 October 2017. The schedule for the visit is extremely full with very little time for entertainment or non-business activities, but any personal expenditure will be met by individual delegates themselves.
- (4) In response to part (4) of the question: No.
- (5) In response to part (5) of the question: The principal gifts for those hosting meetings and visits by the Guildford delegation in Dongying and Beijing are kindly being provided by the British Embassy in Beijing at no cost to the Council. The delegation will also take other small gift items, such as pens, lapel pins and small prints of Guildford. The cost will be small and will be met from within existing budgetary provision. The policy on gifts received by the Guildford delegation is set out in our codes of conduct for councillors and officers.

Councillor Matt Furniss
Deputy Leader of the Council

CO52 TWINNING AND INTERNATIONAL RELATIONSHIPS

The Council considered a report on proposals to enhance and strengthen the existing twinning arrangement with Freiburg and to agree potential new international partnerships that would benefit Guildford.

Guildford had a small of number of existing twinning and other international relationships:

- (a) twinned with Freiburg in Germany since 1979;
- (b) twinned with Bar-le-Duc in France in 1958; and
- (c) linked with Mukono in Uganda since 2003.

Despite some successes, the Council acknowledged that more could be done to nurture existing international relationships for the mutual benefit of Guildford and its partner communities. There were also opportunities for new arrangements with other towns and cities to be explored.

The report had also set out details of the work being undertaken, and proposals put forward, by the cross-party Town Twinning Working Group, which had been established to demonstrate, develop and enhance the benefits of Guildford's existing twinning arrangements and to make recommendations to the Council on any future formal twinning arrangement or similar link.

These proposals included the Council becoming more proactive in leading the relationship with Freiburg, particularly in terms of strengthening economic, tourism and business links.

The report noted that the former Borough Council had twinned with Bar-le-Duc in France in 1958, but that it appeared that the arrangement was allowed to lapse, with no equivalent of the Guildford-Freiburg Association to maintain a close relationship. Following an approach to the current Maire de Bar-le-Duc in September 2016 about the twinning arrangement, it was suggested that the relationship should not be re-established.

The Council was informed that following an approach to the British Embassy in Paris, by the city of Versailles about identifying a suitable UK twin, the Embassy had recommended Guildford and, in May 2017, asked whether the Council would be interested in establishing a twinning agreement.

Discussions had continued through the Embassy and the following areas had been identified as priorities for cooperation:

- (a) developing business links between Guildford and Versailles;
- (b) sharing ideas about how the authorities work with their business communities;
- (c) tourism promotion;
- (d) arts and culture (exchanges and collaboration etc.); and
- (e) links between schools and universities.

Although at an early stage, it was hoped that direct discussions with Versailles could be held in the near future about taking forward a formal twinning agreement.

The report had set out details of the very successful links with Mukono and the various initiatives that had been developed since 2003. The Town Twinning Working Group had commended the Guildford-Mukono Link for developing such strong links and for delivering so many successful projects to benefit residents and, particularly, children in Mukono. The continuation of the formal link was therefore very much supported.

Building on existing links between the Universities of Surrey and Dongying, the opportunity had been taken to explore the establishment of a formal relationship with Dongying City in China. The Town Twinning Working Group had identified a number of potential benefits, details of which were set out in the report. Given the logistical issues, it was considered that any links developed with Dongying were more likely to be focused on businesses and institutions rather than the exchanges between local groups and clubs familiar to the relationship with Freiburg. It was therefore proposed to take forward a link with Dongying in the form of a partnership agreement, details of which were also set out in the report.

A delegation from Dongying had been welcomed to Guildford on 17 July 2017 to discuss areas of cooperation and to sign an expression of interest to develop a formal partnership agreement. Following further discussions, a delegation from Guildford would visit Dongying on 15 and 16 October 2017 and, subject to Council approval, sign the proposed agreement.

The Mayor drew the Council's attention to the supplementary information on the Order Paper as follows:

- Dongying Municipal Government had offered to contribute up to £5,660 (50,000 RMB) towards the Council's travel costs in respect of the visit to Dongying on 15 and 16 October 2017.
- A copy of the Guildford delegation's schedule in Beijing and Dongying
- A detailed breakdown of the costs associated with the Council's delegates' visit to Dongving (and Beijing) is provided below:

Prior to the debate on this matter, and upon the motion of The Mayor, Councillor Nigel Manning seconded by the Deputy Mayor, Councillor Mike Parson, the Council

RESOLVED: That the vote on paragraphs (1), (2) and (3) of the Motion (see below) be conducted by way of a show of hands, and that all other votes taken in relation to this matter, including any amendments, be conducted by way of separate recorded votes.

The Deputy Leader of the Council, Councillor Matt Furniss proposed, and the Leader of the Council, Councillor Paul Spooner, seconded, the adoption of the following motion:

- "(1) That proposed work to develop and strengthen our existing relationship with Freiburg, referred to in the report submitted to the Council, be supported.
- (2) That the twinning arrangement with Bar-le-Duc be formally ended.
- (3) That discussions to progress the establishment of a new formal twinning agreement with Versailles be supported.
- (4) That the Leader and Managing Director be authorised to sign a proposed partnership agreement with Dongying, as set out in Appendix 1 to the report submitted to the Council.
- (5) That the Council considers whether it wishes to accept a contribution of up to £5,660 from the Dongying Municipal Government towards the travel costs of the Leader, Deputy Leader and Managing Director when visiting Dongying.

Reason for Recommendation:

To develop new international relationships and enhance existing twinning arrangements to maximise the benefits for Guildford residents".

Amendment No. 1

Following the debate on the motion, Councillor Susan Parker proposed, and Councillor David Reeve seconded, the following amendment

Substitute the following in place of paragraphs (4) and (5) of the motion:

"(4) That the proposed partnership arrangement with Dongying, including the proposed visit on 15 and 16 October 2017, be cancelled in the interest of conserving public funds."

Abstain:

None

Following the debate on the amendment, it was put to a recorded vote and was lost with 3 councillors voting in favour and 44 against as follows:

For: Cllr Mike Hurdle Cllr Susan Parker Cllr David Reeve Against:
Cllr David Bilbé
Cllr Richard Billington
Cllr Philip Brooker
Cllr Adrian Chandler
Cllr Alexandra Chesterfield
Cllr Nils Christiansen
Cllr Colin Cross
Cllr Geoff Davis

Cllr Graham Ellwood Cllr David Elms Cllr Matt Furniss Cllr Andrew Gomm For: Against: Abstain:

Cllr Angela Goodwin Cllr David Goodwin Cllr Murray Grubb Jnr. Cllr Angela Gunning Cllr Gillian Harwood Cllr Liz Hogger Cllr Christian Holliday Cllr Liz Hooper Cllr Michael Illman Cllr Gordon Jackson Cllr Jennifer Jordan Cllr Nigel Kearse Cllr Sheila Kirkland **Cllr Nigel Manning** Cllr Julia McShane Cllr Bob McShee Cllr Marsha Moselev Cllr Nikki Nelson-Smith Cllr Mike Parsons Cllr Dennis Paul Cllr Tony Phillips Cllr Mike Piper Cllr David Quelch Cllr Caroline Reeves Cllr Iseult Roche Cllr Tony Rooth Cllr Matthew Sarti Cllr Pauline Searle Cllr Paul Spooner Cllr James Walsh Cllr Jenny Wicks

Amendment No. 2

Councillor Tony Rooth proposed, and Councillor Jenny Wicks seconded, the following amendment:

Substitute the following in place of paragraph (4) of the motion:

Cllr David Wright

"(4) That the Leader, Deputy Leader and Managing Director be authorised to visit Beijing and Dongying to investigate and assess in a thorough and objective way the possibility of partnership with Chinese cities and, in particular, Dongying, and to then submit a comprehensive report with recommendations for consideration by the Council at a future meeting."

Following the debate on the amendment, it was put to a recorded vote and was lost with 20 councillors voting in favour, 26 against, with one abstention, as follows:

For: Against: Abstain: Cllr Colin Cross Cllr David Bilbé Cllr Sheila Kirkland Cllr Angela Goodwin Cllr Richard Billington Cllr David Goodwin Cllr Philip Brooker Cllr Murray Grubb Jnr. Cllr Adrian Chandler Cllr Angela Gunning Cllr Alexandra Chesterfield Cllr Gillian Harwood Cllr Nils Christiansen Cllr Liz Hogger Cllr Geoff Davis Cllr Christian Holliday Cllr Graham Ellwood Cllr Mike Hurdle Cllr David Elms

Abstain: For: Against: Cllr Julia McShane **Cllr Matt Furniss** Cllr Bob McShee Cllr Andrew Gomm Cllr Susan Parker Cllr Liz Hooper Cllr Dennis Paul Cllr Michael Illman Cllr Tony Phillips Cllr Gordon Jackson Cllr David Reeve Cllr Jennifer Jordan Cllr Caroline Reeves Cllr Nigel Kearse Cllr Tony Rooth Cllr Nigel Manning Cllr Pauline Searle Cllr Marsha Moseley Cllr James Walsh Cllr Nikki Nelson-Smith Cllr Jenny Wicks Cllr Mike Parsons Cllr Mike Piper Cllr David Quelch Cllr Iseult Roche Cllr Matthew Sarti Cllr Paul Spooner Cllr David Wright

Having considered the original motion, the Council

RESOLVED:

- (1) That proposed work to develop and strengthen our existing relationship with Freiburg, referred to in the report submitted to the Council, be supported.
- (2) That the twinning arrangement with Bar-le-Duc be formally ended.
- (3) That discussions to progress the establishment of a new formal twinning agreement with Versailles be supported.
- (4) That the Leader and Managing Director be authorised to sign a proposed partnership agreement with Dongying, as set out in Appendix 1 to the report submitted to the Council.

Paragraph (4) above was put to a recorded vote and was carried with 29 councillors voting in favour, 16 against, with two abstentions, as follows:

For: Cllr David Bilbé Cllr Richard Billington Cllr Philip Brooker Cllr Adrian Chandler Cllr Alexandra Chesterfield Cllr Nils Christiansen Cllr Geoff Davis Cllr Graham Ellwood Cllr David Elms Cllr Matt Furniss Cllr Andrew Gomm Cllr Murray Grubb Jnr. Cllr Liz Hooper Cllr Michael Illman Cllr Gordon Jackson Cllr Jennifer Jordan Cllr Nigel Kearse Cllr Nigel Manning Cllr Nigel Manning Cllr Nikki Nelson-Smith Cllr Mike Parsons Cllr Dennis Paul Cllr Mike Piper	Against: Cllr Colin Cross Cllr Angela Goodwin Cllr David Goodwin Cllr Angela Gunning Cllr Gillian Harwood Cllr Liz Hogger Cllr Mike Hurdle Cllr Julia McShane Cllr Susan Parker Cllr Tony Phillips Cllr David Reeve Cllr Caroline Reeves Cllr Tony Rooth Cllr Pauline Searle Cllr James Walsh Cllr Jenny Wicks	Abstain: Cllr Christian Holliday Cllr Bob McShee
--	--	--

For: Against: Abstain:

Cllr David Quelch Cllr Iseult Roche Cllr Matthew Sarti Cllr Paul Spooner Cllr David Wright

(5) That the Council agrees to not accept a contribution of up to £5,660 from the Dongying Municipal Government towards the travel costs of the Leader, Deputy Leader and Managing Director when visiting Dongying.

Paragraph (5) was put to a recorded vote with the outcome being that no councillors voted to accept the offer, 44 councillors voted to not accept the offer, with three abstentions, as follows:

Cllr Julia McShane

Cllr Tony Phillips

Accept: Not Accept: Abstain: Cllr David Goodwin

Cllr David Bilbé None Cllr Richard Billington

Cllr Philip Brooker

Cllr Adrian Chandler Cllr Alexandra Chesterfield Cllr Nils Christiansen

Cllr Colin Cross Cllr Geoff Davis Cllr Graham Ellwood

Cllr David Elms **Cllr Matt Furniss**

Cllr Andrew Gomm Cllr Angela Goodwin

Cllr Murray Grubb Jnr.

Cllr Angela Gunning Cllr Gillian Harwood

Cllr Liz Hogger

Cllr Christian Holliday

Cllr Liz Hooper

Cllr Mike Hurdle Cllr Michael Illman

Cllr Gordon Jackson

Cllr Jennifer Jordan Cllr Nigel Kearse

Cllr Sheila Kirkland

Cllr Nigel Manning Cllr Bob McShee

Cllr Marsha Moseley

Cllr Nikki Nelson-Smith

Cllr Susan Parker **Cllr Mike Parsons**

Cllr Dennis Paul

Cllr Mike Piper

Cllr David Quelch Cllr David Reeve

Cllr Caroline Reeves

Cllr Iseult Roche

Cllr Tony Rooth Cllr Matthew Sarti

Cllr Pauline Searle

Cllr Paul Spooner

Cllr James Walsh

Cllr Jenny Wicks

Cllr David Wright

Reason for Decision:

To develop new international relationships and enhance existing twinning arrangements to maximise the benefits for Guildford residents.

CO53 COMMUNITY GOVERNANCE REVIEW: NORMANDY PARISH

The Council considered a detailed report on a proposed community governance review of Normandy parish. A Community Governance Review (CGR) was undertaken by the principal council for the area (i.e. this Council) and was a review of the whole or part of the Borough to consider one or more of the following:

- Creating, merging, altering or abolishing parishes;
- The naming of parishes and the style (i.e. whether to call it a town council or village council etc.) of new parishes;
- The electoral arrangements for parishes (including the number of councillors to be elected to the council, and parish warding), and
- Grouping parishes under a common parish council or de-grouping parishes

The Local Government and Public Involvement in Health Act 2007 had set down the legal framework within which principal councils must undertake such reviews.

The Council noted that a CGR may be undertaken at any time by the principal council but the Council must undertake a CGR upon receipt of a valid community governance petition. On 14 July 2017, the Council received such a petition signed by 189 local electors of Normandy Parish, which had stated:

"We the undersigned, being residents of Normandy, hereby petition Guildford Borough Council to conduct a Community Governance Review of Normandy Parish with a view to increasing the number of parish councillors from its present day level of seven Councillors to nine Councillors".

The Council was asked to approve the proposed terms of reference of the CGR, as set out in Appendix 1 to the report submitted to the Council) together with the proposed timetable for the review. The draft terms of reference included the matters on which public would be consulted, as required by the 2007 Act, namely:

- (1) the petitioners' request as outlined above;
- (2) whether there should be any change to the year in which elections to the parish council are held (currently every four years with next elections due in May 2019); and
- (3) whether Normandy Parish Council should be divided into wards for the purpose of electing parish councillors and, if so, the name, number and boundaries of any such wards, and the number of parish councillors to be elected for such wards.

Upon the motion of the Deputy Leader, Councillor Matt Furniss, seconded by Councillor David Bilbé, the Council

RESOLVED:

- (1) That a community governance review of Normandy Parish be conducted in accordance with the requirements of Chapter 3 of Part 4 of the Local Government and Public Involvement in Health Act 2007, as described in the report submitted to the Council.
- (2) That the terms of reference in respect of the community governance review including the proposed timetable, as set out in Appendix 1 to the report, be approved and published.
- (3) That the Democratic Services Manager be authorised to conduct the community governance review on the Council's behalf and to take all necessary action to comply with the Council's statutory obligations in that regard.

Reason for Decision:

To address the community governance petition received in respect of this matter with a view to ensuring that community governance within the area under review is:

- reflective of the identities and interests of the community in that area; and
- is effective and convenient.

CO54 DRAFT TIMETABLE OF COUNCIL AND COMMITTEE MEETINGS FOR 2018-19 Upon the motion of the Deputy Leader, Councillor Matt Furniss, seconded by the Leader of the Council, Councillor Paul Spooner, the Council

RESOLVED: That the proposed timetable of Council and Committee meetings for the 2018-19 municipal year, as set out in Appendix 1 to the report submitted to the Council, be approved.

Reason for Decision:

To assist with the preparation of individual committee work programmes.

CO55 REPORT OF THE HEARINGS SUB-COMMITTEE ON RECOMMENDED SANCTIONS AGAINST COUNCILLOR DAVID REEVE

The Council considered a report on sanctions recommended by the Hearings Sub-Committee following a local hearing held on 11 September 2017 at which it was found that, after hearing all the evidence, Councillor David Reeve (the "Subject Member") had failed to comply with the Councillors' Code of Conduct.

In accordance with the Council's adopted Arrangements for dealing with allegations of misconduct by councillors, the Sub-Committee, having found that the Subject Member had breached the Code of Conduct, had recommended to Council that the following sanctions should be applied:

- (1) That the Subject Member be asked to apologise specifically to Laura Howard, Principal Planning Officer, regarding the disclosure of the confidential information.
- (2) That the Subject Member be requested to participate in appropriate training, on a one-to-one basis, on the role of the councillor and their responsibilities under the Code of Conduct, in particular reconciling their representational role with their obligations under the Code.

In the absence of a procedure in the Constitution for dealing with sanctions recommended by the Hearings Sub-Committee referred to full Council and, upon the motion of the Mayor, Councillor Nigel Manning, seconded by the Deputy Mayor, Councillor Mike Parsons, the Council:

RESOLVED:

That the following procedure for dealing with this matter at this meeting, be approved:

- Before the debate on the matter, the Council shall hear representations (if any) from the two complainant councillors and the Subject Member about the recommended sanctions, each of whom shall have up to five minutes for this purpose.
- After hearing the representations from the three councillors about the recommended sanctions, the Mayor will ask all of them to absent themselves from the Chamber whilst the Council debates and votes on the matter.

- The five members of the Sub-Committee, who heard the evidence at the hearing, shall remain in the Council meeting, and may participate in the debate and vote thereon.
- After the Council has debated and voted on the recommended sanctions, the three councillors will be invited back into the Chamber".

The Council heard representations from the Subject Member and the two complainant councillors about the recommended sanctions, the three councillors absented themselves from the Chamber.

Councillor Gordon Jackson proposed, and Councillor Richard Billington seconded, the following motion:

"That the Council agrees that the recommendations from the Hearings Sub-Committee that the following sanctions should be applied to the Subject Member:

- (i) That the Subject Member be asked to apologise specifically to Laura Howard, Principal Planning Officer, regarding the disclosure of the confidential information.
- (ii) That the Subject Member be requested to participate in appropriate training, on a one-to-one basis, on the role of the councillor and their responsibilities under the Code of Conduct, in particular reconciling their representational role with their obligations under the Code.

were appropriate and proportionate in view of the finding that the Subject Member had breached the Code of Conduct".

Following the debate on the motion, Councillor Liz Hogger proposed, and Councillor Colin Cross seconded, the following amendment:

In paragraph (ii) of the motion, delete the words "on a one-to-one basis,"

Following the debate on the amendment, it was put to the vote and was carried.

In considering the substantive motion therefore, the Council

RESOLVED:

That the Council agrees that the following sanctions:

- (i) That the Subject Member be asked to apologise specifically to Laura Howard, Principal Planning Officer, regarding the disclosure of the confidential information.
- (ii) That the Subject Member be requested to participate in appropriate training on the role of the councillor and their responsibilities under the Code of Conduct, in particular reconciling their representational role with their obligations under the Code.

are appropriate and proportionate in view of the finding by the Hearings Sub-Committee that the Subject Member had breached the Code of Conduct.

CO56 MINUTES OF THE EXECUTIVE

The Council received and noted the minutes of the meeting of the Executive held on 18 July 2017.

CO57	COM	MON	SEAL
------	-----	-----	------

The Council

RESOLVED: That the Common Seal of the Council be affixed to any documents to give effect to any decisions taken by the Council at this meeting.

The meeting finished at 10.07 pm	
Signed	Date